

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10084083 4

The material reproduced
herein is intended for
the sole use of students
registered in the seminar,
Children and the Law.

CHILDREN AND THE LAW

edited by

Bernard Green

August 1985

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 3 1985

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CHILDREN AND THE LAW

edited by

Bernard Green

August 1985

I am deeply indebted to Teresa Klimushko, Pat Ward and John Vrantsidis for their assistance in the preparation of this casebook.



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/childrenlaw00gree_7

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

A.	<u>General</u>	1
	Introduction	1
	Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms	2
	Marks, "Detours on the Road to Maturity"	5
	Moonkin & Coons, "Toward a Theory of Children's Rights"	13
	Brant, "The Child's Right to Privacy"	19
B.	<u>Children and Medical Services</u>	24
	Singer & Kuhse, The Future of Baby Doe	24
	Tedeschi, Infanticide & Its Apologists	33
	Wadlington, Minors and Health Care	38
	Globe and Mail	44
	Landau, Barriers to Consent to Treatment	45
	Bowker, Minors and Mental Incompetents	52
	<u>Planned Parenthood of Missouri v, Danforth</u>	59A-1
	<u>Bellotti v. Baird</u>	59B-1
	Green & Paul, "Parenthood and the Mentally Retarded"	60
	<u>Re D</u>	65
	Globe & Mail	68

CHAPTER TWO: CHILD WELFARE LEGISLATION

A.	<u>Introduction</u>	70
	Min. Comm & Soc. Services, The Children's Act	71
	Ont. Assoc. C.A.S. Response	73
	Moonkin, "Child-Custody Adjudication: Judicial Functions in the Face of Indeterminacy"	75
B.	<u>Jurisdiction</u>	96
	(a) <u>Introduction</u>	96
	Sypnowich, Society's Child	96
	(b) <u>Voluntary</u>	
	Child Welfare Act	105
	Min. Comm & Soc. Serv., The Children's Act	108
	Ont. Assoc. C.A.S., Response	127
	(c) <u>Involuntary</u>	
	Child Welfare Act	133
	Wald, "State Intervention on Behalf of Neglected Children"	136
	<u>Ex parte D</u>	161
	Globe and Mail	167
	<u>Re C.A.S. Kingston and H and G</u>	169
	* <u>Re Metro Toronto C.C.A.S. and Pamela M</u>	173

Min. Comm & Soc. Serv., Children's Act	180
Ont. Assoc. (A.S., Response	183
C. <u>Process</u>	184
(a) <u>Lawyers and legal rights</u>	184
Child Welfare Act	184
Dickens, "The Child in the Courts"	191
Re W	216
Re C	219
Re C.A.S. Kingston and H and G	226
Min. Comm & Soc. Serv. Children's Act	227
(b) <u>Mediation</u>	227A-1
Note	227A-1
Fuller, Mediation	227B-1
Crouch, Divorce Mediation	227C-1
Bishop, Standards of Practice	227D-1
Pearson & Thoennes, Mediating	227E-1
Levy, Comment	227F-1
D. <u>Disposition</u>	228
(a) <u>Process: experts and prediction</u>	228
Child Welfare Act	228
Dershowitz, "On 'Preventive Detention'"	231
Sypnowich, Society's Child	239
(b) <u>Power</u>	251
Child Welfare Act	251
Re C.A.S. Kingston and H and G	253
Re W.P.D.W.	255
Hansen v. Hamilton C.A.S.	259
J.L. & R.L. v. CAS Halifax	263
Ministry of Community and Social Services, "Foster Care"	263A-3
Min. Comm & Soc. Serv., Children's Act	274
(c) <u>Reviews</u>	277
Child Welfare Act	277
Note, "The Custody Question and Child Neglect Rehearings"	280
Re Cordes-Saathoff et al and C.C.A.S. of Metro Toronto	286
Min. Comm. & Soc. Serv., Children's Act	289

E.	<u>Child Abuse</u>	290
(a)	<u>The statutory Framework</u>	290
	Criminal Code	293
(b)	<u>Reasonable force</u>	
	Dupperon	297
	Sarwer-Fower	300
	Baptiste	304
(c)	<u>The nature of child abuse</u>	305
	Greenland, "Child Abuse in Ontario"	305
	Zigler, "Controlling Child Abuse in America"	314
(d)	<u>State intervention</u>	320
	Schucter, Child Abuse intervention	320
	Globe and Mail	324
	Greenland, "Child Abuse in Ontario"	326
	Helfer, "Why Most Physicians Don't Get Involved in Child Abuse Cases"	333
	Stachula	337A-1

CHAPTER THREE: JUVENILE DELINQUENCY

A.	<u>Introduction</u>	338
	President's Comm. on Law Enforcement and Admin. of Justice	339
	Task force Report: Juvenile Delinquency and Youth Crime	
B.	<u>The Legislation</u>	348
	(1) <u>Canada</u>	348
	Juvenile Delinquents Act and Young Offenders Act	348
	Min of Comm. & Soc. Services, The Children's Act	375
	(2) <u>Sweden</u>	387
	Bolin, Measures to Combat Juvenile Delinquency in Sweden	387
C.	<u>The Issues</u>	403
	(1) <u>Process: The Charter of Rights</u>	403

C.B. v Kimelman	403
Re Southam Inc. and the Queen	407
R. v S.B.	413
Reg v M.	417
<u>K</u>	425
(2) <u>Waiver</u>	426
Reg v M.K.	426
Re C.R.W.	432
Green, The Disposition of Juvenile Offence	436
(3) <u>Disposition</u>	
RE F and the Queen	446
R.D.	448
R.I.	451
D. <u>Diversion</u>	457
Rojek and Erickson, "Reforming the Juvenile Justice System"	457
E. <u>Resources</u>	464
Sub-Committee Report on the constitution of Committee on the Judiciary	464
Ministry of Community and Social Services, "Foster Care"	471
 <u>Appendix</u>	
Child & Family Services Act	474

A. General

Introduction

In ordinary usage, "children" can refer to two different groups: one group characterized by age, the other by a legal relationship between the child and another person, his or her parent.

Our society has determined that a person does not have complete legal rights until he or she has reached a certain age. In this province, by the Age of Majority and Accountability Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 7, a person is vested with full legal capacity at age 18. The eighteen-year-old can vote, marry without parental consent, enter into contracts, etc. But he or she cannot obtain a drink legally in any bar in Ontario until the following year.

Fixing the age for majority at 18 does not answer many questions: (1) At what age shall we allow young people to drive? To leave school? At what age should a person be fully responsible before the criminal law? (2) Does whatever answer you or society gives answer the question, at what age a person should be allowed to obtain an abortion?

Your answer to the last question may be affected by the second meaning that "children" has, i.e., a legal relationship between the "child" and another person, his or her parent. In our society, the legal relationship is normally a product of biology: a parent-child relationship is created as a result of a man and a woman entering into a relationship which produced a child. The usual non-biological method of creating the parent-child relationship is by adoption. See Part IV of the Child Welfare Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 66.

The issues we explore in this seminar involve basic problems of political philosophy. More particularly, we are concerned with the allocation of power between the state, the parents and the child. The historical background is provided in the article by Marks, "Detours on the Road to Maturity," (reproduced below); the basic issues are posed in the article by Mnookin and Coons, "Toward a Theory of Children's Rights," (reproduced below). We focus on one specific problem, that of minor's consent to medical procedures.

The response of the legal system to issues involving children may be affected by the introduction into Canadian law of the Charter of Rights and Freedoms, reproduced below.

CHAPTER TWO: CHILD WELFARE LEGISLATION

A. Introduction

Every jurisdiction in North America has legislation that authorizes the state to intervene in the life of the family by removing the child from his or her home if certain conditions are satisfied. Ontario is no exception. The Child Welfare Act, although revised very recently, betrays its nineteenth century origins; see, for example, s. 19(1).

Among the questions you should consider are the following:

(1) In what circumstances is the state justified in removing the child from his home? (2) Should this decision be based on a cost-benefit analysis - i.e., if the costs (to whom?) outweigh the benefits (to whom?), should the state refuse to intervene? (3) Is it possible to determine the costs and benefits? (See Mnookin, "Child-Custody Adjudication," reproduced herein.) (4) Is the state concerned about the present situation, or is it really concerned about the future consequences of the present situation? (5) If the latter, do we have an accurate means of predicting future human behaviour? (See Dershowitz, "On Preventive Detention," reproduced herein.)

(b) Mediation

One of the more fashionable methods of conflict resolution at the present time is mediation. The technique is based on having two adverse parties reaching - or attempt to reach - an agreement resolving their differences with the assistance of a skilled disinterested third party. Mediation has been historically used in labor relation and international disputes; Mediation is now part of the law of Ontario in child custody adjudication: Children's Law Reform Act, s.31. It is being proposed to help resolve property disputes between husbands and wives in the Family Act, 1985, s.3 (Bill 1, 1985)

C.L.R.A. 31

Mediation	31.—(1) Upon an application for custody of or access to a child, the court, at the request of the parties, by order may appoint a person selected by the parties to mediate any matter specified in the order.
Consent to act	(2) The court shall not appoint a person under subsection (1) unless the person, <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) has consented to act as mediator; and (b) has agreed to file a report with the court within the period of time specified by the court.
Duty of mediator	(3) It is the duty of a mediator to confer with the parties and endeavour to obtain an agreement in respect of the matter.
Form of report	(4) Before entering into mediation on the matter, the parties shall decide whether, <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the mediator is to file a full report on the mediation, including anything that the mediator considers relevant to the matter in mediation; or (b) the mediator is to file a report that either sets out the agreement reached by the parties or states only that the parties did not reach agreement on the matter.
Admissions made in the course of mediation	(7) Where the parties have decided that the mediator's report is to be in the form described in clause (4) (b), evidence of anything said or of any admission or communication made in the course of the mediation is not admissible in any proceeding except with the consent of all parties to the proceeding in which the order was made under subsection (1).
Fees and expenses	(8) The court shall require the parties to pay the fees and expenses of the mediator.
Idem, proportions or amounts	(9) The court shall specify in the order the proportions or amounts of the fees and expenses that the court requires each party to pay.
Idem, serious financial hardship	(10) The court may relieve a party from responsibility for payment of any of the fees and expenses of the mediator where the court is satisfied that payment would cause serious financial hardship to the party.

CHAPTER THREE: JUVENILE DELINQUENCY

A. Introduction

Every (Western) society has had to decide how it will handle persons who are not adults when they have engaged in criminal activity. The responses have taken two basic forms: (1) The North American: on this continent, we have established specialized courts with a special process and special dispositional powers to deal with part of this group. (See the Young Offenders Act, reproduced below. In conjunction with the Young Offenders Act, we have reproduced its predecessor, the Juvenile Delinquents Act. We have done so because the Young Offenders Act has not yet been proclaimed; the cases we reproduce were decided under the Juvenile Delinquents Act.) Those who are above the maximum age for juvenile court jurisdiction are subject to the ordinary process, i.e., trial in adult criminal court.

(2) In some European countries, young people who would be processed in juvenile court in Canada are handled by the ordinary child welfare system. Note that in these countries, too, there is a gap. Thus, in Sweden, the age of criminal responsibility is 15 and anyone 15 years of age or older can be tried in the ordinary criminal courts. See "Measures to Combat Juvenile Delinquency in Sweden," paragraphs 21-24, reproduced below.

